

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
June 27 and July 11, 2013

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on June 27, 2013.

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Robert Sonderman, Joseph Taylor, and Charles Wilson.

JUNE 27TH AGENDA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION REGULATIONS

Proposed update and revisions to DCMR 10-C, Chapter 3 HPRB and CFA Review of Work Affecting Historic Landmarks and Historic Districts, Section 319: Expedited Review under Delegation to the HPO.

The Board approved the updated regulations and directed the staff to submit them for publication in the DC Register.

LANDMARK DESIGNATION HEARINGS

Informational presentation: Context study on Farms and Estates.

No action requested or taken.

George M. Lightfoot House, 1329 Missouri Avenue NW, Case #13-13.

The Board designated the George M. Lightfoot House a Historic Landmark to be entered into the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites. HPO further recommends that the Board forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 9-0.

Sterrett Residence, 3530 Springland Lane NW, Case #13-14.

The Board denied designation of the Sterrett Residence, 3530 Springland Lane NW, as a historic landmark, finding that it did not meet the designation criteria, and recommended not forwarding the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places with a recommendation for listing. Vote: 8-0. (Casarella recused)

Town Center East, 1001 and 1101 3rd Street SW, Case #13-16.

The Board designated Town Center East a historic landmark to be entered into the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended that the nomination be forwarded for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as of local significance, with a period of significance of 1960-1961, the time of the construction of the complex. The Board also recommended additional language about the significance of the site plan to be added to the decision document. Vote: 9-0.

ANACOSTIA HISTORIC DISTRICT

1526 U Street SE, HPA #13-384, two-story rear addition.

This case was deferred to a later hearing at the request of the applicant.

BLAGDEN ALLEY AND SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICTS

1322 9th Street NW, HPA #13-322, concept/new 5-story residential building.

The staff recommends that the Board provide comments and advise the applicant to return to the Board after further development. The Board provided comment and adopted the staff recommendation. Vote: 9-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Randall Junior High School, 65 I Street, SW, concept/rehabilitation and 12-story addition.

The Board forwarded the project to the Mayor's Agent for consideration in conjunction with requested demolition permits, with the following findings: (A) The demolition of portions of the landmark building is not consistent with the purposes of the preservation law; (B) The adaptive rehabilitation of the three main blocks of the school for a contemporary art museum, restaurant, and commercial/education facility is a substantial preservation benefit; and (C) the concept plans are generally compatible with the retained portions of the Randall School and with the L'Enfant Plan, but the wings overhanging the landmark and the treatment of the entrance to the school required restudy and revision. The Board recommended that the applicant continue consultation on design refinements for further review by the Board as appropriate.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Bond Bread Factory and Central Bus Garage, 2146-2112 Georgia Avenue NW, HPA#13-338, raze and revised concept for additions.

The case was deferred at the request of the property owner.

McMillan Park Reservoir, 2501 First Street, NW, HPA 13-#318, concept/park and community center building, rowhouses, grocery and apartment building, office buildings.

The Board heard the applicants presentation and public testimony, and continued the meeting to July 11th.

JULY 11TH AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on July 11, 2013. \

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Robert Sonderman, and Charles Wilson. Absent: Joseph Taylor.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

720 L Street, SE, HPA #13-267, ongoing concept review of new construction.

The Board approved the concept plans and delegated final approval to staff. The applicant will continue to confer with the community on the project, and staff will work with the applicant on final details such as signage, electrical panel placement, and fenestration detailing. Vote: 5-0 (Metzger recused; Wilson and Ally absent).

639 South Carolina Avenue, SE, HPA #13-321, concept/rear addition.

The HPRB found the current proposal incompatible and directed the applicants to refine the design so that the north elevation of the addition is not visible from South Carolina Avenue. Final approval was delegated to staff. Vote: 7-0. (Ally absent).

202 9th Street, SE, HPA #13-383, concept/rear addition.

The HPRB found the project consistent with the purposes of the preservation act and delegated final approval to staff. The Board advised the applicant to work with HPO staff to reduce the mass of the parapet, continue to refine the design to reduce visibility of the loft, railings, and the new construction through the side court. Vote: 8-0.

14TH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1456-60 Church Street, NW, HPA #13-349, concept/8 story rear addition to three-story rowhouses.

The HPRB approved the general concept as consistent with its context, and advised the applicants to continue working with staff to (1) limit the extent of demolition to 1460 Church Street; (2) develop the scope of rehabilitation to the historic facades, 3) and provide greater texture and reduce the scale of the glass wall system. Final approval was delegated to staff. Vote: 8-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK

McMillan Park Reservoir, 2501 First Street, NW, HPA 13-#318, concept/park and community center building, rowhouses, grocery and apartment building, office buildings (*continuation of June 27th meeting*)

The HPRB found the conceptual designs to lack overall cohesion and unity, and did not sufficient relate to or evoke the characteristics of the landmark. The Board voted (6-2) to approve the principles outlined in the master plan design guidelines, but that further work was needed for the projects to be consistent with those principles. The Board voted (8-0) that the concepts should be revised and return for further review when ready; below is a summary of the comments offered:

- 1) A consistent perimeter condition (including the topographical plinth and the Olmsted walk) should be retained. New construction should be pulled back accordingly.***
- 2) The tripartite character of the site should be retained and reinforced. The entrances to the north and south maintenance corridors should be dominant while new openings, curb cuts and roads through the site should be minimized as much as possible. Particular attention was needed in the center section of the site, and suggestions were made for reorienting the buildings and eliminating or reorienting roads and views.***
- 3) Buildings on the site should be developed to provide a unified and cohesive whole.***
- 4) The community center was found to be generally compatible with the character of the site. As the design continues to be developed, meaningful incorporation of the retained underground cell into the center should be considered***
- 5) The park was found to be generally compatible with the character of the site. The planting plan should be developed to frame and enhance rather than obscure views of the above-grade historic structures, and should retain the site's broad sense of open space.***

6) *The townhouses were found to be in need of significant simplification and rethinking of the materials and colors, and should be organized to coalesce into larger block-fronts that relate to the larger civic scale of the site.*

7) *The mixed-use grocery store and apartment building was found to be conceptually strong and the strong expression of the base and the use of setbacks for the tower were appreciated. However, the sharp contrast of materials and geometries were generally thought too discordant and distracting from the character of the site.*

8) *The medical office buildings were found to be unconnected to the site, outward facing with too much sheer vertical height concentrated immediately on the north maintenance corridor. It was suggested that the mass be pushed to the north and the healing garden open space either be more oriented to or opened up to the interior of the site. If the north maintenance corridor wall is be removed, the base of this building (and others along the corridor) should more closely reference it; the building should also more fully engage the retained cell 14.*

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

207 New York Avenue, NW, HPA #13-261, concept/add second and third floor to one-story commercial building.

The HPO recommends that the Board: (A) determine the building at 207 New York Avenue, NW to not contribute to the character of the Mount Vernon Square Historic District, as it lacks any distinguishing architectural characteristics and is not representative of important development patterns or building types identified in the National Register nomination; (B) approve the concept for a flush two-story addition to the building to be consistent with the character of the historic district; and (C) find the proposed design for the two-story addition incompatible with the character of the historic district, and that the front façade materials, fenestration, detailing and ornament should be simplified as noted above. Vote: 6-0. (Sonderman and Wilson absent)

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

3224 16th Street NW, HPA #13-320, extend driveway paving to create parking spaces in front of building.

The Board recommend denial of the application to retain the paved parking spaces as incompatible with the character of the historic district. Vote: 6-0. (Sonderman and Wilson absent)

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

2237 13th Street, NW, HPA #13-264, concept/third floor addition.

The Board found this concept compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act provided the roof addition is not visible from 13th Street to the north side of Florida Avenue. The Board delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 6-0 (Sonderman and Wilson absent).

1451 S Street NW, HPA #13-398, concept/ rear three story addition.

The Board found the proposed concept compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act, and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 6-0 (Sonderman and Wilson absent).

KALORAMA TRIANGLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2012-2014 Kalorama Road NW, HPA#13-348, rear addition and renovation.

The case was deferred to the July hearing at the request of the applicant.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following items on the consent calendar on June 27.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

1733 16th Street, NW, Scottish Rite Temple, HPA #13-391, concept/renovations, ADA access.

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

117 New York Avenue NW, HPA #13-385, concept/3-story rear addition to 3-story rowhouse.

WASHINGTON HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

1837 Kalorama Road NW, HPA #13-327, concept/rear addition.

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, www.olenderreporting.com, or info@OlenderReporting.com. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <http://planning.dc.gov>